REPORTS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra) : Madam, I lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Public Accounts Committee :—

(i) Ninth Report on Metro, Railway, Calcutta-Procurement of Sophisticated Signalling Equipment.

(ii) Tenth Report on Export Processing Zones.

RE. LETTER OF FINANCE MINISTER TO PRESIDENT, WORLD BANK, LAID ON THE TABLE ON 26-2-1992.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Subramanian Swamy.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal) : Madam...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will allow him first and then I will allow you.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) : Madam...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You also. "You" also means plural, you know. It is not only singular.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, the plural of "you" becomes "we".

Madam, I am thankful to you for giving me permission to raise this matter concerning the papers laid by the Finance Minister yesterday. I quote paragraph 6 from the comments that he gave in reply to the Leader of the Opposition, Mr. S. Jaipal Reddy. 'The Finance Minister proposes to place a copy of the letter of 11th November, 1991 addressed to Mr. Preston on the Table of the Rajya Sabha on the 29th February, 1992. There is no intention to withhold any information from the honourable House.'

Madam, on a perusal of the papers given to us, we find precisely that either wittingly or unwittingly— I am not in a position to say just now—to withhold information from the House what the Finance Minister has presented is identical to what the Leader of the Opposition Mr. Jaipal Reddy bad earlier . But it is *a.* small part of the whole document. I may quote from May's Parliamentrry Practice by Kaul and Shakdher, the relevant pages if you like, Madam. But it is a well-established Parliamentary practice that if a document is referred to then the entire document must be placed in the House. Indeed I find that the portions that .are not placed are the ones which have been concerning the nation today about what assurances have been given to the World Bank.

Madam, I have the whole report with me here and with your permission I may quote some of the parts which will make us...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN t We are not having any discussion. You are only raising an objection. .. .*[Interruptions).*. .1 cannot permit you to read anything from any report.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Please listen to me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is limited permission that you have been given. Mr. Subramanian Swamy, you are a very senior Member of this House. A limited permission is granted to you to raise an objection which you have raised. I cannot permit you to read out from any report whatsoever as in your hand. *(Interruptions).* I am not allowing you. I am very sorry. Please do not read.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I will not read. But let me say this. When I am making an objection, you do not expect me to get up and just say, "I object". You expect me to make a case as to why that objection is to be taken

[Shri Subramanian Swamy]

seriously, why there is some substance in it. What I am trying to say is that as the Finance Minister's own documentation says, he has presented start of the report which includes this letter. Indeed, if the whole report is placed before the House, it will show that certain assurances were given which are outside the purview of general policy statements or specific commitments and the World Bank has concluded, on the basis of these assurances, that they will be included, by April, by Parliament, in the Budget and their loan may be sanctioned. So the nation has the right to know what the commitments made are. There are 27 such commitments which are specific and which I have a list of. If you give me permission, I will read out from that. Or, you give me permission to lay the whole document on the Table so that the whole nation can know what have been agreed to.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No. I will not give you permission.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : According to thr Finance Minister, in the Chamber—Madam, if I may refer to that conversation-he says, "I am ready to place all the documents on the Table. And he says, in the letter, in the comments, to Mr. Jaipal Reddy, has said, "We do not want to withhold any information" and, therefore, we need to know the whole thing. The whole report, including the comments of *the* World Bank President associated with that letter, must be placed on the Table of the House and also an explanation given how a letter written by the Finance Minister in Delhi on the 11th November could be acted upon and a 43-page comment could be given by the World Bank President within 24 hours, sitting in Washington. There seems to be some mystery about it as well. Tkank you.

Minister of president

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra) : Madam, I am on a point of order. My point of order is, we are discussing the correspondence between the World Bank and the Government of India, etc. Madam, in a lighter mood, 1 would have really requested you to ask the World Bank to open a sub-branch of their in the parliament Library Hall so that everybody wiii understand what things are going on. But on the substantive point raised by my friend, I am really sorry to say that the Opposition is making a false case. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Is that a point of order ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Do you want me to react on it ?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : A Budget deals with taxes and so many other problems. Yesterday, a document was given. Mr. Jaipal Reddy placed that on the Table. Now, it is very easy to place documents before the House because a pretice has been started... *(Interruptions)*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त (मध्य प्रदेश): मैडम प्वाइंट ऑफ आर्डर का पता तो चलना चाहिए।

उपसभापति : जब तक सुनेंगे नहीं तो पता कैसे चलेगा ?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : The Budget is something different. Tbe documentation is something different. And the solution is to open a World Bank Parliamentary Branch in our Parliament House.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu) : Madam, please permit me. *(Interruption?).*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, the Chairman has permitted us. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Dipen Ghosh has taken the permission of the Chairman to say

something. Let these two people speak. Then I wiii permit you, Mr. Swaminathan.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam Deputy Chairman, I am glad that you have given me permission to raise this issue. Yesterday, Mr. Jaipal Reddy was allowed to lay on the Table a report, a document. Later, in the afternoon, the Union Finance Minister laid on the Table a letter with one annexure, that is, Annexure II. And that letter was dated the lllh November. It is found that the letter does not contain all the an-nexuresor ail parts cf the document. The document is titled as Annexure-2. There is "report and recommendations of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development and the International Development Association" dated 12th November to the Executive director on prcrosed structural adjustments, leans and ar amount equivalent to so and to to India. This report was submitted to the Executive Director next day which *inter alia* contains annexure of Mr. Manmohan Singh's letter wfrcn he laid on the Table yesterday afternoon. Mr. Kulkanv perhaps does not know that India has an Exeufve D'rctor in the World Bank, by name, Mr. J. S. Baiial. He is an IAS Officer and his office is the extension of the Ministry of F-nance of the Government of India. It is a part of the Government of India. The report which Mr. Baiial has received from the World Bank contain; the letter of the Union Finance Minister that Baiia's office is an extension cf the Ministty of Finance. So while laying on the Table a part of that document, Mr. Manmohan Singh has suppressed that information from Parliament though he had stated in his reply to Mr. Jaipal Reddy's notice for breach of privilege that be has no intention to with hold any information,Madam, I consider the placement of that report more important before the Budget is presented because that report says, review will be done... *interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, you have made your point. Lei me allow other Members.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : And hat review would provide a forum 10 discuss with the authorities the recommendations of several high level Committees established by the Government and their incorporations to the extent appropriate to the 1992-93 Budget. They have established a Committee and they will make *a* review. They will monitor and see to what extent they can incorporate these proposals in 1992-93 Budget. It is apprising them of the Budget secrets. It is ve-yimportant. Madam, that today itself you must give directions from the Chair to the Union Finance Minister to lay on the Table a report so that we can discuss it before the Budeet is presented. That report contains... *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Shri Yashwant Sinha, I would-like Mr. Sinha to be very brief and to the point, 1 have given commitment to Mr. Sinha. I will allow you. *{Interruptions).* If everybody speaks on it, then we will have a discussion on it. The Chairman gave a limited permission and I am going to use 'hat limited permission in the same spirit in which he allowed it. I cannot allow everybody to speak on it. *(Interruptions).* The Chairman did not tell me to allow the leader of the political parties. *(Interruptions).* J. cannot allow. I am sorry. We have to run this House according to cartain rule; and procedure. We cannot allow every thing every day. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : Madam, 1 am also a party. I am the leader of mv party.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You are a patty of this house also. Let Mr. Yashwant Sinha speak who has been allowed to speak. *(Interruptions).* There is no discussion over here that I should allow on party basis. Otherwise, there will be no end to it. *{Interruptions).*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, I am always very brief. Madam Deputy Chairnrm, the point that all of us are trying to make is t at the document which has bsen plac, by the Finance Minister,namely his letter of the 11th November, to the President of the World Bank, is hat the complete document. There are other parts of the document which are related to this letter and, therefore, the Finance Minister, in all fairness, should take this House into confidence and place the entire document before this House. This is out demand number one. And the reason why we are miking this demand is—because we are in possession of the copies of this document—I am also prepared to authenicate and place it on the Table if there is any hesitation on the part fo the Government to do so— that the World Bank, as Mr. Dipen Ghosh has said, prepared a report on the basis of the letter of the Finance Ministe! which was circulated to the Executive Director on the 12th November, the very next day after this letteer was sent from Delhi. And in that, several extremely compromising positions had bsen stated by the World Bauk President. The Finance Minister or the Government of India cannot claum that he is not aware of them because those documents are available With the Ministry of Finance also and he is aware of them. And if there was anything to which the Finance Minister or the Finance Ministry or the Executive Director in the World Bank wanted to take exception or object, then between 12th November and today there was enough time for them to say that this was not the correct interpretation of the Government of India's policy. The very feet that nothing of that sort has happened is a clear indication of the admission on the part of the Government of India of all these things which have been said in the World Bank report and they, as I said, Madam Deputy Chairman, severely compromise the position of this country as a me mber of the World Bank, as a taker of a loan and as a sovereign country; that is why we demand that these documents should also be placed on the Table of the House so that .his House and the country should know what exactly has happened... *{Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Swaminathan.. .*(Interruptions)* ... Let me identify properly... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR (Nominated) : Madam, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whit is your point of order, Mr. Ambedkar ?.. .*iInterruptions)*... It is a point of order. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : No, she has identified me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; Yes, I have identified you, but let me first dispose of his point of order.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : Madam, there are certain procedures according to which we lay papers on the Table of the House. There are certain documents which do not come on the Table of the House, keeping in mind the national security. On the documents which are not attached and which the hon. Members have referred to, I would like to have a ruling from you whether they form part of the annexures which are not being placed on the Table of the House by the hon. Finance Minister. Do they form part of documents which fall under the category of "national security" ? If they fall under "national security", I want a lulling on it ; if they don't fall, then they should be placed on the Table of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; I have no access to those documents. So I will not give any ruleing.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : I request the Chair to callforthepapers,examine them, give a rulling on them and then place them on the Table.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Swaminathan. ... *{Interruptions)* .. .There is no point of order in it. I have no access to those documents I can't say what they are... *{Interruptions).* .. I have no access to the documents which were placed yesterday. If they fall under "national security", I don't thnk everyone should have access to them. I don't know anyihing about them *{Interruptions)* Mr. Swaminathan.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Madam, you are aware of what has transpired yesterday. The Leader of the Opposition said thiit he would place the letter of 11th November and he wanted the Finance Minister to place the letter, and it was placed. Subsequently, there was a discussion in the Chamber where it was decided that the letter of 11th November would be placed and that there would not be any discussion on this matter here before the presentation of the Budget becuse ultimately... *{Interruptions)...* The Opposition wanted to... *{Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : We don't refer to discussions in the Chamber. There has been a further discussion in the Chamber to which Mr. Swaminathan...

SHRI G. G. SWELL : He cannot place a partial document

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not permitted you. Please take *your* seat.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN They wanted the letter of 11th November which was placed Now they are saying, that there was some action on 12th November. They wallt' letters of subsequent dates and"... *{Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let him complete his point. ... *{Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN ; Once you want the letter of 11th November, and then.. .*{Interruptions).* ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He has a rihgt to have his own opinion. You can't object to it. He can give his opinion.. .*{Interruptions)*

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, may I have a say ? *Interruptions.* ..I am requesting you. *{Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Will everybody sit down ? Please (*Intrrruptions).* . .

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I an. requesting you. *{Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAM : Mr. Swaminathan, now you take, your scat. You made your point. (*Interruptions).* .Please take your seat. *{Interruptions).* .The Minister wants to say something about it. Wait. (*Interruptions)...* Please, order. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions).* .1 am on a point of order, I say. *{Interruptions)...* Please let me state my point of order. *{Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is your point of order ? *{Interruptions)...*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Please, listen to me. *{Interruptions)...*

TRE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You don't have to get agitated over a point of order. *{Interruptions)...*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADA-SWAMY : Please listen to me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am listening to you. *(Interruptions)*..

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I am standing here but you dsn't allow me. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am allowing you. What else ? You are standing and I am allowing you. What else am I doing ? *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : You are allowing me ? Okay. *(Interruptions)*... I am sorry. You are allowing. It is okay.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, I am allowing you.

SHRl M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Please don't get agitated yourself. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please order. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : My point of order is this. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please, he is on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. G. SWELL : Madam, you said that you would allow me to put a question.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please, just a minute. Let the point of order be disposed of.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : After that 1 will ask my question.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : My point of order is this. The document which has been referred to by my colleagues here is already under circulation. It is not as if they are not under circulation. *I* want to know from the Chair whether the doubts and misgivings arising out of this document which has been circulated should be eliminated. I want to know from the Chair whether the Pa'liament has got a right to information and whether the Parliament has got access to important documents without which there can be no useful debate.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : My railing on this is that the Parliament has a right to information at the appropriate time. *{Interrup tions)* .....

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu) : No, Why at the appropriate time ? *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : What is the appropriate time ? *(Interruptions)*...

उपसभापति : राम अवधेश जी, बैठिये। आपके आग के मेंबर क्वेशचन पूछ रहे है।

Just a minute. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. G. SWELL : What are you saying ? I can't follow. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. Please sit down.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : May I ask my question ? *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You ask your question.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : Just a question. *(Interruptions)*... lam not very good in English. I can't put things straight. *(Interruptions)*... Please listen to me. Madam, it is said that the very next day the President of the World Bank wrote a comprehensive note to the Board of Directors recommending the grant of this loan to the Government of India on the basis of the letter written by the Finance Minister. I would like to know whether you are in possession of that document or not and whether you are aware of it since you have your own Executive Director in the Board of Directors.

This letter which was placed by the Minister yesterday is not complete. You have to place the other document also if you have it *(Interruptions)*.. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, there is a question put to you. Please answer. *(Interruptions)*... Now, the question is being put. *(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*.. .Let him answer. I can't answer that question because that is not mine. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : You said that you would allow me. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : 1 have no information. Let the Government answer.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIA MENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRL RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM) : Madam Deputy Cba'rmari, firstly I would like to thank you... *(Interruption?)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, not everybody. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI. R. BALUTamil Nadu) : What is this ? *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I would request that you please make your sound a little proper and polite. I am cooperating with you. *(Interruptions)*.. .Please, don't interrupt. *(Interruptions)*... Please don't raise your voice for no reason. The Chairman has given very limited pertmisson and I want to stick to it. *I* will not allow you. *(Interruptions)*.. No, I will not. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Then, 1 am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no point of order. I have alredy identified the Minister. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : I am on a point of order. *(Inter ruptions)* .....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not listening to you. He is on his legs. *(Interruptions)*.. .Please sit down. I have not permitted you to speak. So, please take your seat. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*. ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Don't argue every day with the Chair. This is not the proper way to function every day. *(Interrutpions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*. ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; I am not allowing your point of order. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu) : How can it be? You have permitted him. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; I am not allowing. *(Interruptions)*.,. I won't allow. *(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing. *(Interruptions)*... Don't shout, please. I say, don't shout. *(Interruptions)*.. .Please don't shout. I say. *(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. Please keep quiet. *(Interruptions)*. I am not allowing. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY ; This is not fair, Madam. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing. *(Interruptions)*. Please don't shout. I have been authorised by the Members to run this House, and I am running it the way I should. *(Interruptions)*. Please go back to your seats. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : I am-only requesting you. *(Inter-rupions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. There is no need *to* be agitated. If you read the rule book, it says, it is entirely up to the Chair to listen to the point of order at what point of time. When I have identified the Minister, I will identify the Minister. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI T. JI. BALU : You said that you will allow.. .*(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I did not say that. I have a very good memory. Mr. Minister, please speak.

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM : Madam Deputy Chairman, I would like to... *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Listen to him. *(Interruptions).* Never mind. I don't care whatever you say about me. *(Interruptions).* Pilase sit down. I am not going to allow you. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Madam, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Ministe^ please speak. You speak to the Chair.

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM : Madam Deputy-Chairman; yesterday, Mr. Chairman was kind enough to direct that the letter written... *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I may remind the Members...

AN HON. MEMBER : No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; that do you mean by "no" ? May [ask, what is the meaning of no ? While you are speaking, you should realise what you are speaking. No to what ? Is it know or no ? You should spell it out. *(Interruptions).* Listen to me. The Chairman allowed three Members.. .*(Interruptions).* You ask the Chairman, not me. Don't put any question to me. I said that the Chairman gave me... *(Interruptions).* I am not allowing. You may argue the whole day. If you irritate me, I will allow you to go on speaking like this and no.,. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Is this the way to run this House ? *(Interruptions).*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Madam, you need not allow me to speak. But I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is a Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. He has a right to speak as much as you have. And it is for me to decide who will speak. *(Inter-rupions).*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : But lam on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; I will allow your point of order when it will suit the Chair. *(Interruptions).* I am not allowing. *(Interruptions).* There is no point in raising your voice, Mr. Balu. Mr. Gopalsamy, please sit down. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY ; Madam, this is discrimination... *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You have every right to say what you like. I am within my rights as Chairperson. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : We have every right/to speak.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN ; I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI R A N G A R A J A N KUMARAMANGALAM : Madam, the hon. Finance Minister is actually held up in the other House on the same issue. If I may submit... *-{Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have never worked under pressure in this Chair. I can remind the Members, whether they belong to any political party or group I will never work under pressure. I have certain rules to run this House." I am not going to run this House under pressure: I will adjourn the House, but I will not run the House under-pressure. You cannot dictate to the Chair. Please^ sit down. You are a senior Member of this House, please sit downs. *(Interruptions).* There are certain rules and procedures... *(Interruptions)...* A point' of order is not a right of the Member. You cannot get up every time.. *.(Interruptions)* ... Please read the Book .;. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : You have violated the procedure.. *.(Interruptions): ..*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; Please take your seat... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Madam, please.. *.(Interruption).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am .vary-sorry, you don't even allow your leader to speak.. *.(Interruptions)* .'.. Please sit down., *(Interruptions)...*

SHRl MURASOLI MARAN *i* Madam, by this time-I would have-finished my point of order... *(Interruptions);..*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN J Please take your seat.. *.(Jmermp-tions)...* I am; allowing i you. I will allow you But once I have allowed the Minister, I will listen to him "first ...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM : Madam, Chairperson, the hon. Finance Minister is unfortunately held up in the other House on almost a similar matter. I would like to bring to the notice of this august House through you that we "were not reluctant to place any document on the Table of the House. We were asked to place the letter written by the Finance Minister to the World Bi?nk. We were directed.. *.(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please, just listen to him. Have patience.. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM : We did place it on the Table of the House. Now, what is being pointed out is that, that letter forms part of an annexure of a report given by the President of the World Bank to his Executive Directors. Now, I may point out that, that is a document which deals with communication from the President of the World Bank to his Executive Directors and not to the Government of India... *(Interruptions). ..*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please listen to him. If you are not interested, I am interested. Please.

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM : *Ma&xm,* Chairperson, we did not say that we are not in posssession. Because, rightly so, India has the opportunity of having—not that all countries have—

An Executive Director ont the Board. Therefore the Executive Director gets-a copy. Since it is addressed to all the Executive Directors of the World Bank, we did have it. But it is not a communication, lam repeating it, it is not a communication to the Government of India. It is a communication *inter se* among the officials. We did get hold of the copy. I am not saying no. We did get hold of the copy that is meant for

[Shri Rangaragan Kumaramangalam]

official purpose within the World Bank. Now, normally we are not supposed to go and place every document. But Jwe are still not saying we will not. In fact, further, even after all this we have had an agreement with the World Bank ; so any document that the Chair, the Chairman, wishes us to place on the Table of the House, we are willing to place, We have nothing to hide. We will give every document that they want. We are willing to bring it all to their notice because we feel we have done everything in the interest of the nation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now what is the objection ? Yes, Mr. Maran,. .*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM : Madam Chairperson, if I may add, depending on whatever direction the Chairman may give, the Finance Minister will definitely carry out, I have been told to say.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Madam, the hon. Minister is very naive. India has an Executive Director in the World Bank... *(Interruptions)*... I will tell' you what are the documents that are to be made available to the House. First the hon. Minister on his own placed the letter of intent which was sent . - *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : No. He did not place it on his own... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Chairman directed him to place it... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Maran is capable defending his case. Allow him to speak. ..*(Interruptions).*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : So the letter of intent was placed on the Table of the House.

Then there is the internal response paper usually made available to all Executive Directors. What are the contents of this internal response paper to the letter of intent ? That has not been placed. India has a Director, Executive Director, and he has a copy of it. So we want that the interanl response paper be placed on the Table. Secondly, with the World Bank, you are going to have a structural adjustment loan. So, what are the conditions imposed ? Thirdly, you are going for extended fund facility which is much bigger and it contains larger conditions. What are the conditions ? What is the communication between you and the World Bank regarding extended fund facility ? This is not only a question of capitulating before the World Bank. And it is not only a question of leaking the Budget. Already some secrets have been leaked out. One of the six conditions of the industrial Policy is that they should decontrol Steel.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Is it a point of order or a point of information ?

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN • The condition was accepted in November. On 16th January, steel was decontrolled.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Maran, it is a point of information and not a point of order.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : But in the meanwhile the prices of the shares of the steel companies went high. They made a fortune...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no point of order.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : They have already let the secret out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, Special Mention.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Therefore, I accuse the Government of letting the secret out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Maran, what is the point of order ? There is no point of order. This is a point of information and under the guise of point of order, I can't permit it.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : I am coming to the point of order. The secret was let out in November and accordingly, steel was decontrolled on Jan. 16 and somebody was allowed to make a fortune.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, that is enough.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Is it not a point of propriety ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is the point of order ?

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : The Minister should own the responsbility because...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is the point of order ?

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : It is not a matter of propriety ? Someone in the Government should own the responsibility and resign.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : This is not a point of order.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : is it a matter of propriety or not 7 Have not the secrets been leaked out ? Has not somebody made a fortune ?

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMAR AM ANGALAM : Madam, I think it is important that, through you, I should inform this August House that they would be aware that this is not the first World Bank transaction that the Government is having. Many Governments have had to.. .*(Interruptions)* Will you allow me to have a say ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Allow him to say something.

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM : In the past, these transactions have never been laid on the Table of the House by the respective Governments. Still if the Chairman directs, we are willing, We have not got anything to hide. We have done everything in the. interests of the nation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter is closed. Now, Special Mentions. Shri Shankar Dayal Singh ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : The Government is willing to lay the paper. Madam, what is your ruling ? What is your direction on this ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is for the Chairman to decide. I have no direction.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : You are in the Chair.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am in the Chair. All right.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : You are in the Chair and you have to give a ruling.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The permission was not directly taken from me. The permission was sought from the Chairman. I will put the matter before the Chairman and you also put before the Chairman. It is entirely upto you.. .*(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : You are presiding. You are the Deputy Chairman of this House. You have to...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I don't to do anything. Shri Shankai Dayal Singh.. .*(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA If they were unwilling one couli understand. The Government i willing. Then by is the Chai coming in the way ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is over now. Shri P. Upendra... *{Interruptions)* Shri Ashwani Kumar ...*{Interruptions)* Please take your seat... *{Interruptions)*

SHR[YASHWANT SINHA : Everyon.; is willing. Then, *hy don't you say ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I said very clearly. As a very very senior Member and as one who has run the Government, you shoul d know thit once I give my ruling that everything is in the^ands of the Chairman, I think the matter is closed.. .*{Interruptions)* Please don't speak anything., .*{Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : The discussion was in your presence. You know that the decision has taken.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The matter is closed... *{Interruptions)* I would not like to give you any assurance. I won't give anyassmance ...*{Interruptions)*

SHRI DlPEN GHOSH : I have a point of order. Would you give the House an assurance ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No assurance.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Will you communicate th's willingness of the Government to the Chairman ? Let us know in the afternoon.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I want to again very specifically say tint the matter will be considered by the Chairman and not by me and the proceed'ngs of the House, I am.sure, the Chiirmin will see and you can also seek this permission ... *{Interruptions)* Will you sit down and listen to me ?...

श्री चन्द्रानन मिश्र (बिहार): हम तो कभी बोलते नहीं । वह हल्ला-गुल्ला करेंगे, तो आप मान जायेंगे । (व्यवधान)..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN.: lam not permitting you. Please sit down... *{Interruptions)* 'When I am speaking—

आप इतने बुजुर्ग हैं, आप तो बैठ जाइये । मुझ से सवाल किया –

I cannot answer every question in the same time.'..*{Interruptions)* I am not permitting , I said,' please . - .*{Interruptions)* I will not commit anything. Let the Chairman take the decision. If he directs, it Avill be done. Shri Ashwi.ni Kumar. Shri Gurudas Das Gupta. Shri Shanti Tyagi.

SHRIMURASOLI MARAN : *Will* you take it up to the Chairma

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है । ...(व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now Special Mentions.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है । मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि .. (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no ; we have moved to another business. -We have Special Mentions,..

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न आपको सुनना पड़ेगा ।

उपसभापति : किसके बारे में है ?

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : कल आपने व्यवस्था दी थी और आज हम लोगों को पत्राचार श्री गुजर, जो डाइरेक्टर हैं उनसे मिला है । मेरा सिर्फ यह निवेदन है कि इस पत्राचार का अनुवाद करवा करके पत्राचार की हिन्दी में प्रति दिलवाइये ।

उपसभापति: हिन्दी में . . . (व्यवधान).

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : आप हिन्दी में दिलवा दीजिए ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will find out from the Secretariat whether they can get it translated intoHindi.

ओरिजनल चिट्ठी अंग्रेजी में थी । आपने कल कहा नहीं था इसलिए नहीं हुआ । आपने ओरिजनल लैटर की कापी मांगी थी वह मिल गई । अब आप मांग रहे हैं तो हिन्दी में ट्रांसलेट करेंगे !

एक माननीय सदस्य : अभी दिलवा दीजिए । . . . (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
It is difficult to get it done immediately.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : When are they going to do it ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I don't know.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : At the moment you are presiding over the House...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whenever the Chairman directs. I give no assurance. Mr. Dipen Ghosh, please take your seat. That matter is over. We have moved to another business.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Let the Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs say that they are going to lay it on the Table...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Government is willing. Did you not hear what the Government said ? At least I heard it. On behalf of the Government the Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs very dearly said, "If the Chairman directs...". So, if the Chairman of Rajya Sabha directs, then the Government will lay it. Let the Chairman direct first. He has not yet directed.

Smq DIPEN GHOSH : Let the i House be adjourned till the Chairman gives his direction.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
No, no ; I am not ging to adjourn the House. We have to transact the business of the House. *(interruptions)* I cannot adjourn the House everyday. Special Mentions, Mr, Shanti Tyagi.

SPECIAL MENTIONS

Lack of development of Trans-Yamuna area in Delhi due to haphazard planning causing health hazards

श्री शांति त्यागी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, मेरा यह स्पेशल मेंशन पूर्वी दिल्ली यमुना पार के क्षेत्र में आबाद लाखों नागरिकों के गंदगी और बीमारियों से घिरे हुए जीवन के बारे में है । आपने इजाजत दी, धन्यवाद । इस इलाके में, ट्रांस यमुना के इलाके में आबादी दिन-रात बढ़ती गई है, लेकिन पब्लिक हैल्थ के साधनों का कोई इंतजाम नहीं है । मैडम, इसी वजह से 1988 के साल में यमुना पार के इलाके में हैजे की महामारी का प्रकोप हो चुका है और जिसमें अनेक जाने चली गई थीं ।

मैडम, पूर्वी दिल्ली में स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं का नक्शा मैं इस सदन के सामने पेश कर रहा हूं । कुल अस्पताल 7, अस्पतालों में बैडज कुल 1901, एलोपैथिक डिस्पैंसरीज कुल 50, आयुर्वेदिक डिस्पेंसरीज कुल 14, होम्योपैथिक कुल 11, पोलिक्लिनिक एक, स्कूल क्लीनिक्स 15 हैं । मैडम, 860 मकानों के लिए कूड़ा जमा करने का महज एक प्वायंट, यमुना पार इलाके में 150 आदमियों पर एक लैटरिन । यमुना पार इलाके की सविसेज का यह नक्शा है ।

मैडम, इस क्षेत्र में एक हजार आदमियों पर मात्र आधी बैड आती है जबकि बाकी दिल्ली